

# Contents

<b>Abstract</b>	<b>ii</b>
<b>Acknowledgments</b>	<b>iv</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>7</b>
1.1 Chapter Introduction . . . . .	7
1.2 Background . . . . .	7
1.3 Statement of Research Question . . . . .	10
1.4 Structure of The Thesis . . . . .	10
<b>2 Literature Review</b>	<b>14</b>
2.1 Chapter Introduction . . . . .	14
2.2 Best-First Search Algorithms . . . . .	15
2.2.1 Conspiracy Number Search . . . . .	15
2.2.2 Proof Number Search . . . . .	16
2.2.3 Monte-Carlo Tree Solver . . . . .	18
2.3 Combining Certainties with Uncertainties . . . . .	19
2.3.1 Product Propagation . . . . .	19
2.3.2 Monte-carlo Proof Number Search . . . . .	21
2.4 Game-tree Structures . . . . .	23
2.4.1 MIN/MAX tree . . . . .	23
2.4.2 AND/OR Tree . . . . .	24
2.4.3 Balanced vs Unbalanced Game-tree . . . . .	25
2.5 Uncertainty in Entertainment: Game Refinement Theory . . . . .	26
2.5.1 Motion in Mind . . . . .	27

2.6	Chapter Summary . . . . .	28
<b>3</b>	<b>Characterizing the Probability-based Proof Number Search</b>	<b>29</b>
3.1	Chapter Introduction . . . . .	29
3.2	Probability-based Proof Number Search Algorithm . . . . .	30
3.2.1	Probability-based Proof Number . . . . .	30
3.2.2	Algorithm of Probability-based Proof Number Search . . . . .	32
3.3	Game Test-Beds . . . . .	35
3.3.1	Connect Four . . . . .	35
3.3.2	Othello . . . . .	36
3.4	Experimental Setup . . . . .	38
3.5	Result and Discussion . . . . .	39
3.5.1	Experimental Result on Connect 4 . . . . .	39
3.5.2	Experiment Results on Othello . . . . .	43
3.5.3	Discussion . . . . .	45
3.6	Chapter Summary . . . . .	48
<b>4</b>	<b>Solving Single-Agent Game with Probability-based Proof Number Search</b>	<b>49</b>
4.1	Chapter Introduction . . . . .	49
4.2	Single Agent Game . . . . .	50
4.3	Single Agent Probability-based Proof Number Search Algorithm . . . . .	51
4.4	Game Test-Bed: 2x2 2048 . . . . .	52
4.5	Research Methodology . . . . .	53
4.5.1	Application of PPN-Search to 2x2 2048 . . . . .	53
4.5.2	Experimental Setup . . . . .	54
4.6	Result and Discussion . . . . .	54
4.7	Chapter Summary . . . . .	6
<b>5</b>	<b>Finding the Critical Aspect of Single-Agent Game Using Single Con-</b>	
	<b>spiracy Number Indicator</b>	<b>58</b>
5.1	Chapter Introduction . . . . .	58
5.2	Single Conspiracy Number . . . . .	59
5.2.1	Application of SCN to Two-player Games . . . . .	60

5.3	Research Methodology . . . . .	63
5.3.1	2048 as The Test-Beds of Single-Agent Game . . . . .	63
5.3.2	SCN and Expectimax Algorithm . . . . .	64
5.3.3	Experimental Setup . . . . .	66
5.4	Result and Discussion . . . . .	66
5.4.1	Result . . . . .	66
5.4.2	Discussion . . . . .	70
5.4.3	Game Play Implications to level-3ise . . . . .	71
5.5	Implications of Player Experience to Player Entertainment . . . . .	73
5.5.1	Applying Result of Different Player level-3ise to Motion in Mind concept . . . . .	74
5.6	Chapter Summary . . . . .	78
<b>6</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>80</b>
	<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>83</b>
	<b>Publications</b>	<b>91</b>

# List of Figures

2-1	Illustration of a MIN/MAX game-tree. The MAX nodes are represented by square, while the MIN nodes are represented by circles. . . . .	23
2-2	Illustration of an AND/OR game-tree. The OR nodes are represented by square, while the AND nodes are represented by circles. . . . .	24
2-3	Illustration of information in unbalanced (left) versus balanced (right) game-tree. . . . .	25
3-1	Illustration of <i>PPN</i> calculation in PPN-Search. OR nodes are displayed as square, while AND nodes are displayed as circle. . . . .	32
3-2	Illustration of <i>pmc</i> calculation in MCPNS. OR nodes are displayed as square, while AND nodes are displayed as circle. . . . .	32
3-3	Illustration of Connect Four with a 7×6 board. . . . .	35
3-4	Illustration of Othello with an 8×8 board. . . . .	37
3-5	Number of Connect Four positions solved, unsolved, and out of bounds by PNS, MCPNS, and PPN-Search. . . . .	39
3-6	PPN value of the root of two different positions for PPN-Search. . . . .	40
3-7	Number of positions solved, unsolved, and out of bounds by PPN-Search. . . . .	42
3-8	The completion percentage of PNS, MCPNS, and PPN-Search for different numbers of moves. . . . .	44
3-9	The completion percentage of PPN-Search in different stages of Othello. The left-most area colored in orange represents the opening stage of Othello, the middle area (blue) represents the middle game of Othello, and the right-most green area represents the end game of Othello. . . . .	46
4-1	Illustration of initial positions ins 2x2 2048. . . . .	52

4-2	Number of 2x2 2048 initial positions solved, unsolved, and out of bounds by PNS, MCPNS, and PPN-Search. . . . .	54
5-1	Illustration of tile merging from an initial state of 2048 game, where the player choose to move “down” (left). Then, a random tile appeared in a single turn of the 2048 game right after the merged tile (right). . . . .	64
5-2	Illustration of SCN calculation in the Expectimax framework. . . . .	65
5-3	Comparison of SCN of 2048 games calculated using threshold configuration of $T1$ (change with new high number of tile) and $T2$ (constant). In all of the results, the highest number on the board at the end of the game is 2048. Note that the SCN value is normalized between 0 and 1. . . . .	68
5-4	Illustration of 2048 game with $d = 2$ (SCN value normalized between 0 and 1) . . . . .	69
5-5	Illustration of 2048 game with $d = 3$ (SCN value normalized between 0 and 1) . . . . .	69
5-6	Illustration of 2048 game with $d = 4$ . . . . .	70
5-7	Examples of boards with different SCN values . . . . .	72
5-8	Depiction of the occurrence of the “stability trap“ in the simulated level-3 player game ( $d = 4$ ). level-3 players would be able to escape the position and continue their game, leading to a higher score and longer game . . . .	73
5-9	Depiction of the occurrence of the “stability trap“ in the simulated level-2 player game ( $d = 3$ ). level-2 players have a higher chance to be trapped in the position, leading to an early end of the game . . . . .	74
5-10	SCN based Motion in Mind values for: (a) $d=2$ , (b) $d=3$ , (c) $d=4$ , and (d) $d=5$ . . . . .	76

# List of Tables

2.1	Analogical Link Between Motion in Mind and Motion in Physics. . . . .	27
3.1	Average time and node for each PPN-Search configurations. . . . .	43
3.2	Experimental result of different algorithms applied to Othello positions. . .	43
3.3	Additional experiment result of applying PPN-Search to different stages of Othello positions. . . . .	45
3.4	Best performance search algorithms in different tree structure. . . . .	48
4.1	Mechanics In Single Player Games. . . . .	51
4.2	Average iterations and nodes visited of PNS, MCPNS, and PPN-Search. . .	55
5.1	Result of Expectimax implementation on 2048 Game. . . . .	66
5.2	Results of the Application of Motion in Mind to 2048. . . . .	75
5.3	Analogical Link Between Motion in Mind and SCN in Games . . . . .	78